Australian Capital Territory

Heritage (Decision about Provisional Registration of 22 Stuart Street, Griffith) Notice 2009 (No 1)

Notifiable Instrument NI2009-401

made under the

Heritage Act 2004 s34 Notice of decision about Provisional Registration

1. Name of instrument

This instrument is the Heritage (*Decision about Provisional Registration of 22 Stuart Street, Griffith*) Notice 2009 (No 1).

2. Commencement

This instrument commences on the day after notification.

3. Notice of Decision

Pursuant to Section 34 of the *Heritage Act 2004* the ACT Heritage Council has decided not to provisionally register 22 *Stuart Street, Griffith*.

Mr Gerhard Zatschler Secretary ACT Heritage Council GPO Box 158, Canberra ACT 2602

20 August 2009



ACT Heritage Council

STATEMENT OF REASONS

DECISION REGARDING THE INCLUSION OF 22 STUART STREET (BLOCK 12, SECTION 48, GRIFFITH) IN THE ACT HERITAGE REGISTER

Background

22 Stuart Street (Block 12, Section 48, Griffith) was nominated to the interim ACT Heritage Places Register in 2001, as an intact 1938 house and a good example of Department of Interior housing and landscape. On 21 March 2002, the Heritage Council agreed to interim list the property under the heritage provisions of *Land (Planning and Environment) Act* 1991, as a matter of priority. In December 2002, the Council again confirmed its intention to proceed with the interim listing of the place. These decisions were made whilst new owners had purchased the residence and were seeking development approval for changes to the place.

The place remained in the backlog of nominated places, but has now been assessed. At Meeting 27 on 20 August 2009, the ACT Heritage Council endorsed a Statement of Reasons which does not find 22 Stuart Street, Griffith, eligible for provisional listing due to extensive changes that have compromised the integrity of the building's original design and setting.

Detailed reasoning of why the 22 Stuart Street, Griffith, does not meet the threshold for listing under the heritage criteria at Section 10 of the *Heritage Act 2004* is included under **Assessment.**

Assessment

The Council's assessment against the criteria specified in s.10 of the *Heritage Act 2004* follows.

In assessing the nomination for the 22 Stuart Street, Griffith, the Council considered:

- The original nomination form provided by the nominator.
- Materials held on file by Council on the Assessment File: 02/01183
- The evidence from the development assessment process on File: 220/48/12
- The physical evidence and surrounding context as ascertained from a street view assessment in February 2008 and July 2009.

GPO Box 158 CANBERRA ACT 2601

In relation to the place:

Criterion (a) it demonstrates a high degree of technical or creative achievement (or both), by showing qualities of innovation, discovery, invention or an exceptionally fine level of application of existing techniques or approaches

The nominator has assessed the place as of low significance against this criterion. stating:

The house contains roll screen retractable fly screens on most windows, which are in good condition. These innovative screens (for their era) are becoming rare.

Heritage Council assessment:

22 Stuart Street, Griffith, does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (b) *it exhibits outstanding design or aesthetic qualities valued by the community or a cultural group*

The nominator has assessed the place as of low significance against this criterion, stating:

The place is a simple face red brick ex government cottage of no significant design merit.

Heritage Council assessment: 22 Stuart Street, Griffith, does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (c) it is important as evidence of a distinctive way of life, taste, tradition, religion, land use, custom, process, design or function that is no longer practised, is in danger of being lost or is of exceptional interest.

The nominator has assessed the place as being of high significance against this criterion, stating:

Interior fittings are not identified as intrinsic features however; the house contains a very high degree of original fabric detail, finishes and fixtures. The furniture and soft furnishings in the house are believed not to have changed since the late 1930s.

Heritage Council assessment:

22 Stuart Street, Griffith, has undergone major changes to its internal detail, finishes and fixtures as part of a major extension to the rear of the original residence which has resulted in the loss of the original layout and original fixtures and finishes. Whilst the façade facing the street is largely unchanged its integrity has been compromised by the addition of a brick carport forward of the building line. The house therefore does not meet the threshold for heritage listing under this criterion.

GPO Box 158 CANBERRA ACT 2601

Criterion (d) it is highly valued by the community or a cultural group for reasons of strong or special religious, spiritual, cultural, educational or social associations

The nominator has assessed the place as being of low significance under this criterion, stating:

The house or its past residents are not known to have particular social significance.

Heritage Council assessment: 22 Stuart Street, Griffith, does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (e) it is significant to the ACT because of its importance as part of local Aboriginal tradition

The nominator has made no claim against this criterion.

Heritage Council assessment:

There is no evidence that 22 Stuart Street, Griffith, is significant to the Aboriginal community. 22 Stuart Street, Griffith, does not meet the threshold for heritage listing under this criterion.

Criterion (f) it is a rare or unique example of its kind, or is rare or unique in its comparative intactness

The nominator has assessed the place as being of medium significance under this criterion, stating:

The place is a relatively intact example of a government house in Canberra. Without comparative analysis it cannot be determined how rare it is.

Heritage Council assessment:

The Heritage Council concurs with the nominator's statement that without a comparative assessment the rarity of the place can not be established. The integrity of the place has been compromised by the large extension to the house and the carport forward of the building line and can no longer be considered an intact example of a government house in Canberra.

22 Stuart Street, Griffith does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (g) *it is a notable example of a kind of place or object and demonstrates the main characteristics of that kind*

The nominator has assessed the place as being of medium significance under this criterion, stating:

The building, both internally and externally demonstrates the quality and characteristics of 1930s government housing.

Heritage Council assessment:

The nominator has not indicated the quality or the characteristics of 1930s government housing the residence demonstrates. The integrity of the place has been dramatically compromised by the large extension to the rear of the original residence and the carport located forward of the building line.

GPO Box 158 CANBERRA ACT 2601

22 Stuart Street, Griffith, does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (h) *it has strong or special associations with a person, group, event, development or cultural phase in local or national history The nominator has assessed the place as being of low significance against this criterion, stating:*

The residence is associated with the growth of Canberra in the late 1930s and the need for government to support the city's growth by providing public housing. It is associated with the early development of the suburb of Griffith.

Heritage Council assessment: 22 Stuart Street, Griffith, does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (i) it is significant for understanding the evolution of natural landscapes, including significant geological features, landforms, biota or natural processes

The nominator made no claim against this criterion.

Heritage Council assessment: This criterion is not applicable.

Criterion (j) it has provided, or is likely to provide, information that will contribute significantly to a wider understanding of the natural or cultural history of the ACT because of its use or potential use as a research site or object, teaching site or object, type locality or benchmark site

The nominator claims that:

The place has the ability to demonstrate and teach about life in Canberra in the 1930s -1940s.

Heritage Council assessment:

Due to extensive alterations and internal changes this place no longer has the capacity to demonstrate and teach about life in Canberra in the 1930s-1940s.

22 Stuart Street, Griffith, does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (k) for a place—it exhibits unusual richness, diversity or significant transitions of flora, fauna or natural landscapes and their elements

Heritage Council assessment: This criterion is not applicable.

GPO Box 158 CANBERRA ACT 2601

Criterion (1) for a place—it is a significant ecological community, habitat or locality for any of the following: (i) the life cycle of native species; (ii) rare, threatened or uncommon species; (iii) species at the limits of their natural range; (iv) distinct occurrences of species

Heritage Council assessment: This criterion is not applicable.

Conclusion

The ACT Heritage Council finds that 22 Stuart Street, Griffith, is of insufficient heritage value to warrant provisional registration in the ACT Heritage Register.

Dr Michael Pearson (Chair) ACT Heritage Council

20 August 2009

GPO Box 158 CANBERRA ACT 2601